Macroprudential Policies and Housing Prices: A New Database and Empirical Evidence for CESEE

by Vandenbussche, Vogel and Detragiache

Comments by Stefan Gerlach, Central Bank of Ireland

This paper was presented at Housing, Stability and the Macroeconomy: International Perspectives conference, November 14-15 2013. The conference was sponsored by the Federal Reserve Bank of Dallas, the International Monetary Fund, and the Journal of Money, Credit and Banking. The conference was held at Federal Reserve Bank of Dallas (http://dallasfed.org).
Macroprudential Policies and Housing Prices:
A new database and empirical evidence for CESEE

by Vandenbussche, Vogel and Detragiache

Comments by Stefan Gerlach
Big picture

- Two main contributions:
  - Compiles a comprehensive data base on Macro Prudential Policies (MPP) used in CESEE.
  - Offers empirical evidence on the impact of MPPs & house prices (HPs) in CESEE:
    1. Changes in (i) *minimum CAR*, (ii) *marginal reserve requirements on foreign funding*, and (iii) *marginal reserve requirements on credit growth* matter.
    2. Other MPPs do not appear to have impacted on HPs.
    3. MPPs more effective when tightened and in booms.
• Authors discuss potential weaknesses:
   1. Endogeneity bias.
   2. Effects delayed by more than 2 quarters.
   3. Effects may have occurred on announcement.
   4. Coding of the policy variables (scoring rule).

• Interesting paper provides some preliminary but provocative results and offers a data base for other researchers.


**MPP and house prices**

- House price bubbles have played central role in many episodes of financial instability.
  - Discouraging that so few MPP instruments are significant.
  - Perhaps the MPPs studied here were not intended to slow HP increases but to protect the banking system?
    - LTVs & DTIs commonly used & effective in Asia but little used in CESEE.
    - Restrictions of FX lending might have been motivated by consumer protection considerations rather than HP concerns.
- To assess effectiveness of MPPs, need to understand (i) why they were adopted & (ii) how they were intended to work.
- Also useful to provide more information about the CESEE economies and whether they are special.
  - Eg., how important is credit for house purchases?

- How does MPP work?
  - Given stance of MP and state of economy, MPPs reduce banks' ability and willingness to lend.
  - Banks raise intermediation spreads and restrict lending.

- Authors motivate looking at HPs for data availability reasons.
  - Not clear that HP data are better.
  - Many other factors impact on HPs.
  - Also study impact on credit growth and lending spreads.
Gerlach and Peng (JBF 2005) study credit growth and HPs in Hong Kong around the introduction of a LTV in 1991.

- Model carefully the relationship between HP & credit.

- Expectations of future economic conditions impacted on the demand for housing (and HPs) and therefore credit demand.

- Recursive estimates show that credit demand much less sensitive to HPs after LTV was introduced.
Other comments

• The results warrant more discussion.
  − Why are changes in the minimum CAR effective in contrast to changes in risk weights?
  − Many variables with "wrong" & significant signs in Table 2.
    ✓ Max FX loans/capital; risk weight on FX mortgages, consumer loans, FX consumer loans, total consumer loans … ; liquidity ratio; FX liquidity ratio, FX DTI; Total DTI.
    ✓ Reflect endogeneity or introduced after the crisis?

• Choice of endogenous variable:
  − Since HP-to-income ratio is stationary, why not use it as dependent variable?